## MINUTES OF THE AUBURN CITY HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW AND PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MAY 1, 2007

The joint session of the Auburn City Historic Design Review and Planning Commission was called to order on May 1, 2007 at 6:02 p.m. by Chairman Merz in the Council Chambers, 1225 Lincoln Way, Auburn, California.

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs,

Elder, Kidd, Chrm. Merz

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Thompson

**STAFF PRESENT:** Will Wong, Community Development Director;

Steve Geiger, Associate Planner; Sue Fraizer,

Administrative Assistant

ITEM I: CALL TO ORDER

ITEM II: PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ITEM III: APPROVAL OF MINUTES

None.

ITEM IV: PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ITEM V: PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

A. <u>Historic Design Review – 185 Linden Avenue (Frank R. Lewis) – File HDR 07-8.</u> The applicant requests Historic Design Review approval for illuminated and non-illuminated wall signs located at 185 Linden Avenue. This item was continued from the April 3, 2007 and April 17, 2007 Historic Design Review Commission hearings to allow the applicant to Work with staff on a revised proposal. The applicant is requesting an additional continuance to the May 15, 2007 hearing.

The Commission voted to continue this item to May 15, 2007.

#### B. <u>Historic Design Review and Variance – 160 Elm Avenue</u> (Martin Ray – The Car Lot, Inc.) – Files HDR 07-9 and VA

<u>07-4.</u> The applicant requests Historic Design Review approval to allow "The Car Lot" monument sign located at 160 Elm Avenue previously approved to be constructed of metal to instead by constructed of wood. The proposal also includes design review of a secondary freestanding sign, a wall sign located on the office building, and various promotional signage including flags and pennants. This item was continued from the April 17, 2007 joint session of the Historic Design Review Commission and Planning Commission.

Planner Geiger gave the staff report. At the conclusion of the April 17 meeting, the Commission requested that the applicant consider taking a look at the existing monument sign and consider encasing all of the pole within the monument sign to give the sign a more completed appearance. The applicant was also asked to remove all of the unpermitted signage at the site. Also, the Commission requested that the property owner be present at tonight's meeting. Planner Geiger provided background about the monument sign. The property owner was notified about tonight's meeting.

Staff drove by the site and saw that the unpermitted signage has been removed from the property. Staff recommends approval of the applicant's proposal.

The public hearing was opened.

The applicant, Martin Ray, 681 Millertown Road, Auburn introduced himself. The property owner, Donna Kuper introduced herself. Mr. Ray stated that when he was negotiating a lease on the property, the real estate agent told him that the existing signage was grandfathered in. He now understands that this was not true. When he applied for the sign permit, his original proposal was for a metal sign to be bolted on to the existing pole sign. Once the change was made to a monument sign, he was not involved in the design of the sign and the landlord took over with the application. Once he saw the monument sign frame being erected he realized that his original plan for a metal sign would not work because it would be too flimsy. He then had the wood sign made. He didn't realize that the wood sign was going to be out of compliance with the application.

Mrs. Kuper stated that she feels this was an honest mistake. In hindsight, she feels that the wooden sign is much sturdier.

Comm. Kosla asked if there is a satellite dish attached to the pole.

Mrs. Kuper said yes there is, and it belongs to Sundance Computers, the tenant right below the car lot. She added that the pole used for the sign also serves as a heating vent, holds a lighting fixture, and has electrical wiring coming through it.

Chrm. Merz gave Mr. Ray the opportunity to speak about the other signs and banners that are on the car lot.

Mr. Ray stated that the DMV requires that a sign be affixed to the building. He explained the reasons for placement of the other signs and banners.

Mrs. Kuper stated that she feels that Mr. Ray's business is a friendly and valuable business for the community.

Chrm. Merz asked staff if they were aware that the DMV requires a sign at the business.

Planner Geiger said he had heard of that requirement.

Comm. Worthington asked Mr. Ray why he did not bring up the DMV sign requirement at the time when the monument sign was being discussed.

Mr. Ray replied that he did not realize he needed to obtain approval for that sign.

There was discussion about whether the monument sign would meet the requirement of the DMV for signage at the business.

Director Wong stated that his understanding is that the DMV requirement is that a sign be placed on the building. The main issue is the design of the sign.

Chrm. Merz stated that his biggest goal is to achieve a sign that is attractive. He asked the applicant if he would be willing to put a metal, aluminum or wood frame around the sign to make it look more attractive and to waterproof it.

Mrs. Kuper said that she doesn't think it needs waterproofing or framing. She said except for not being metal, it was built as

it was approved. It is her opinion that a frame would not make the sign more attractive, but would make it look odd.

Comm. Smith noted that at the last meeting it was requested that the applicant consider the possibility of encasing the pole with rock veneer to make it look more complete. He asked the applicant if he is in favor of doing that.

Mr. Ray replied that he will not pay more money to make the sign look prettier. With all the wires coming out of it, only about 6 more inches of the pole could be covered.

Comm. Smith asked Mrs. Kuper if she'd be willing to do that.

Mrs. Kuper replied that she doesn't think it is necessary and it would hinder the existing uses of the pole. It was built per the approval.

Comm. Kosla said that he has no problem with the sign being constructed of wood. He expressed his appreciation to Mr. Ray for taking down the unpermitted signs. He stated that due to the unique location and layout of the business, he feels some additional signage is needed. He would like for the wording on Condition #4 concerning streamers and banners to be changed to say that they be kept in "excellent" condition.

Comm. Kidd, Comm. Elder and Comm. Briggs all agreed with Comm. Kosla.

Comm. Worthington said she feels the location is a gateway to the community, and she does not feel that the additional signage is needed.

Chrm. Merz stated that he was at the first meeting for this application. He felt that the applicant had readily complied with everything he was asked to do. He does not feel that way tonight. He offered for the applicant to add a frame to the sign, and only heard opposition from the applicant and landlord. He feels a frame would make the sign more attractive.

Mr. Ray stated that he is willing to install a frame around the sign.

#### Chrm. Merz **MOVED** to:

Adopt HDRC Resolution No. 07-10 as modified by the Historic Design Review Commission by the addition of

a condition that the monument sign face be allowed to be constructed of wood and be finished with a 4" to 6" frame.

#### Comm. Smith SECONDED.

AYES: Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Elder, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: Kosla ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

#### Comm. Kosla MOVED to:

Amend Condition #4 of HDRC Resolution No. 07-10 to read: "The flags and pennants shall be maintained in excellent condition. If any of the flags or pennants become torn, damaged or otherwise deteriorated, they shall be immediately replaced by the business owner at his expense".

#### Comm. Kidd SECONDED.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Elder, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

The Commissioners discussed the signs being presented, and determined to vote for each proposed sign separately as follows:

#### Comm. Worthington **MOVED** to:

Approve the request for the monument sign for Martin Ray – The Car Lot, Inc. (File #HDR 07-9) with the additional conditions as previously approved.

#### Comm. Smith **SECONDED.**

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Elder, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

#### Comm. Briggs MOVED to:

Approve the request for the freestanding sign on the stairwell for Martin Ray – The Car Lot, Inc. (File #HDR 07-9).

#### Comm. Kidd SECONDED.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Briggs, Elder, Kidd, Chrm. Merz

NOES: Worthington

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

#### Comm. Kidd MOVED to:

Approve the request for the wall sign on the office building for Martin Ray – The Car Lot, Inc. (File #HDR 07-9).

#### Comm. Briggs **SECONDED.**

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Briggs, Elder, Kidd, Chrm. Merz

NOES: Worthington

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

#### Comm. Kidd MOVED to:

Approve the banners for Martin Ray – The Car Lot, Inc. (File #HDR 07-9).

#### Comm. Smith **SECONDED.**

There was discussion about the inclusion of pennants in this motion.

#### Comm. Kidd **MOVED** to:

Approve the banners and pennants for Martin Ray –

The Car Lot, Inc. (File #HDR 07-9).

Comm. Kosla SECONDED.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Elder, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

Chrm. Merz asked for any discussion or a motion by the Planning Commission about the Variance for this application.

Comm. Worthington MOVED to:

Direct staff to amend Planning Commission Resolution No. 07-8 for denial of the Variance application (File #VA 07-4).

The motion failed for lack of a second.

Comm. Kosla MOVED to:

Adopt Planning Commission Resolution No. 07-8 as presented, approving the Variance application (File #VA 07-4) to allow the second freestanding sign on the subject property.

Comm. Smith **SECONDED.** 

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Chrm. Merz

NOES: Worthington

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

# C. <u>Historic Design Review Permit – 601 Lincoln Way</u> (Chamber of Commerce) – File HDR 07-12. The applicant requests Historic Design Review approval to enclose a loading dock to increase office space by approximately 354 square feet, addition of a roof mounted clock structure, and other exterior changes for the Auburn Chamber of Commerce located at 601 Lincoln Way.

Planner Geiger gave the staff report. The applicant proposes to enclose the existing loading dock area located on the north side of the building. This remodel will result in no change to the footprint of the existing building. The building will be repainted with the existing colors. New siding will match the existing horizontal siding. Windows will be added along the north, west and east sides of the new office area. Windows and trim will match those existing on the building. The front door will be replaced with a metal door that will have a wood appearance, similar in style to the existing door. The new storage room will have a metal roll up door to be painted beige. New roofing materials will match the existing composition roof on the building. The roof will be extended on the northeast corner to cover the storage area. A roof extension will be added on the west side of the building over the front entry door.

On the peak of the roof near the center of the building, a cupola is proposed. The cupola materials and paint colors will match those on the building. A clock with a 36" face will be placed on the north, west and south sides of the cupola. The final clock design has not been determined, and the applicant does not currently have funding for the clock. Electricity will be stubbed in for the clock and it will be installed when funding is available. Staff recommends a condition that the final design of the clock faces are subject to review and approval of staff.

Staff believes the proposal is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines, and recommends approval of the application.

Comm. Worthington asked if there would be an attempt to create a seamless transition between the existing building and the new addition.

Planner Geiger stated that this is staff's understanding.

Comm. Elder asked if the storage shed height will obstruct the historic telegraph windows.

Planner Geiger explained how the storage shed height will affect the building.

The public hearing was opened.

Bruce Cosgrove, CEO for the Auburn Chamber of Commerce, 601 Lincoln Way, Auburn stated that many community leaders have been involved in the design for the modifications. He

explained the history of the building and the changes to the building. Most of the windows in the building are original. The reason for a new door is that the existing door is weather-beaten. Their goal is for the storage shed to appear as a part of the building rather than a storage shed. They feel the cupola adds interest to the building and there are other area cities such as Davis and Truckee with stations utilizing cupolas. The existing sign will be redesigned and an application submitted at a later time.

Comm. Worthington suggested that one of the rail cars be used as a relic for people to look at.

Mr. Cosgrove replied that the cars were purchased from the railroad, however they are too close to the railroad tracks for public access.

Comm. Briggs asked if the historic windows are wood framed.

Mr. Cosgrove said that they are wood framed and single paned.

Comm. Briggs asked if the new windows will match the existing historic windows.

Mr. Cosgrove stated that they will appear to be wood framed, but they will actually be metal framed.

Comm. Elder stated that she does not think the cupola is architecturally correct for the building.

Mr. Cosgrove stated that they feel the cupola adds interest to the building, and it is architecturally appropriate and consistent with the architecture of the building.

Comm. Briggs asked for an estimate of time until the clocks are installed.

Mr. Cosgrove replied that they hope for the clock to be completed later in 2007.

Steve Galyardt, President of the Auburn Chamber of Commerce, 601 Lincoln Way, Auburn stated that the proposed construction has been planned for many years. This construction will enhance the historical appearance and increase the functionality of the building.

Donna Howell, 405 Linden Avenue, Auburn stated that she is opposed to the cupola. She handed out pictures of the original building to the Commissioners.

Comm. Worthington asked Ms. Howell if she is opposed to the storage area addition.

Ms. Howell stated that as long as it matches the original building, she thinks it is fine.

The public hearing was closed.

Comm. Elder repeated that she is opposed to the cupola. Comm. Briggs agreed.

Comm. Worthington stated she feels the applicant has done an excellent job in keeping with the historic design guidelines and she is in favor of the cupola. Commissioners Smith, Kosla and Kidd agreed.

Mr. Cosgrove stated that they will make an extra effort to make the cupola appear as if it was designed for the building.

Comm. Worthington MOVED to:

Adopt Resolution No. 07-12 as presented, approving the proposed changes to the Auburn Chamber of Commerce building located at 601 Lincoln Way.

Comm. Smith **SECONDED**.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: Elder ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

D. <u>Historic Design Review Permit – 789 High Street (Granite Community Bank) – File HDR 07-13.</u> The applicant requests Historic Design Review approval to modify an existing building by the addition of a new store front, a new ATM sun screen, and extension of the existing green awning for Granite Community Bank located at 789 High Street.

Planner Geiger gave the staff report. The applicant proposes to modify the existing store front that faces Cleveland Ave. A

photo of the building as it exists was shown, as well as a photo enhanced with the proposed improvements. Proposed improvements include replacing an existing roll-up metal door with store front windows and an entry door, the addition of a sun screen in front of the ATM machine, and the extension of the existing green awning in order to cover the new windows and door.

The proposed windows and door will be similar to those existing on the building. The ATM sunscreen will be made of a tinted plexiglass material and will have black anodized aluminum framing similar to the windows. The existing small fabric awning over the ATM machine will be removed and replaced with a longer green awning which will match the existing awning.

Staff is in support of the applicant's request.

Comm. Worthington asked what the need is for the new store front.

Planner Geiger replied that the bank is remodeling the inside of the building to provide more office space.

Comm. Worthington asked why there is a need for a sunscreen at the ATM machine.

Planner Geiger suggested that this question be addressed to the applicant.

The applicant, Bud Bolander, P.O. Box 5515, Auburn introduced himself. He stated that the purpose of the sunscreen is to provide better visibility of the ATM screen when the sun is shining on it. It also provides a privacy barrier for customers using the ATM machine. The new store front and interior improvements are strictly for office employee use.

Comm. Worthington asked if the plan accurately reflects the distance between the handicapped loading zone and the proposed sunscreen. She expressed concern about how the drawing indicates that the sunscreen will encroach into the loading zone.

Mr. Boland replied that the plan is accurate.

There was a discussion about the loading zone with regard to the location of the proposed sunscreen.

Planning Commission May 1, 2007

Director Wong stated that the applicant will have to comply with ADA requirements. If approved, staff will verify prior to approval.

Comm. Worthington asked the applicant to explain the personal space setback of the sunscreen.

Mr. Bolander stated that most people waiting in line to use the ATM machine would stand at the edge of the sunscreen.

Comm. Worthington asked if other designs were considered for the sunscreen.

Mr. Bolander replied that the purpose of the screen is to shield customers from the sun. They want it to be as transparent as possible for security reasons.

Comm. Worthington suggested that the applicant consider placing the sunscreen on top of a three foot high freestanding wall for a better fit to the area.

Comm. Kidd stated that a person could crouch under the screen if it were three feet high.

Bob Snyder, 100 Marina Ave., Auburn stated that as a customer at this bank, the sunscreen is definitely needed.

The public hearing was closed.

Comm. Kosla stated that he is in favor of this request.

Comm. Smith asked if the extended awning might provide enough shade to eliminate the need for the sunscreen.

Mr. Bolander stated that the awning would not provide enough shade for the ATM screen.

#### Comm. Kidd **MOVED** to:

Adopt Resolution No. 07-9 as presented, approving a new store front, a new ATM sun screen and the extension of the existing awning for Granite Community Bank located at 789 High Street.

#### Comm. Smith SECONDED.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Briggs, Elder, Kidd, Chrm.

Merz

NOES: Worthington

ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

E. <u>Historic Design Review Permit – 111 Sacramento Street</u>
(Gold Rush Plaza) – File HDR 07-14. The applicant requests
Historic Design Review approval for the repainting,
replacement of letters, and refurbishing of the existing wall
sign for the Gold Rush Plaza building located at 111
Sacramento Street.

Planner Geiger gave the staff report. He showed a picture of this project after it was completed. The applicant has repainted the sign and the letters and refurbished the sign, which is currently hanging on the wall at the Gold Rush Plaza. The applicant is before the Commission requesting approval of this sign.

Comm. Kosla asked why code enforcement did not ask the applicant why he did not obtain a permit for the sign.

Planner Geiger stated that the code enforcement officer did not see the sign, so staff was unaware that it had been installed.

Director Wong pointed out that the applicant had spoken with staff prior to installing the sign, and was aware that he needed to submit an application prior to installation.

The public hearing was opened.

The applicant, Richard Fong, 12110 Herdal Drive, Auburn explained that when he came and asked staff whether he needed a permit, staff was unsure. He explained to staff what he wanted to do to the sign. It was taking time to get an approval from staff and he was losing business, so he decided to update the sign and get it installed.

Comm. Worthington told the applicant that she would have appreciated it he had submitted his application first. She does feel that the completed sign was nicely done.

Comm. Kidd agreed, and asked Mr. Fong if he also painted the building.

Mr. Fong said no, he did not.

Chrm. Merz also agreed with Comm. Worthington.

#### Comm. Kidd **MOVED** to:

Adopt Resolution No. 07-14 as presented, approving the repainting, replacement of letters, and refurbishing of the existing wall sign for the Gold Rush Plaza building located at 111 Sacramento Street.

#### Comm. Elder SECONDED.

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Worthington, Briggs, Elder, Kidd,

Chrm. Merz

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

The motion was approved.

F. <u>Historic Design Review Permit – 1145 Lincoln Way</u>

<u>Meritage Auto Repair) – File HDR 07-15.</u> The applicant requests Historic Design Review approval for three (3) wall signs for Meritage Auto Repair located at 1145 Lincoln Way.

Planner Geiger gave the staff report. He explained the placement of the signs. The signs will be made of wood, painted with a white background with red and blue lettering and a blue borderline with similar style fonts. Based upon the amount of building frontage, the sign sizes comply with the zoning ordinance. Staff is in support of the applicant's request.

Comm. Worthington stated that she had received a letter indicating that groundwater testing was being done which would determine this businesses' right to stay in business. Therefore, she said she would abstain from voting on this proposal.

Comm. Elder complimented staff on including the historical resources inventory for this building.

The applicant, Ray Makari, 418 Spring Ct, Pilot Hill explained that about seven years ago the business was a gas station with an underground tank. It has been cleaned up, and they are now monitoring the underground soil. It is not related to his business.

Comm. Kidd asked the applicant if the building owner is planning to paint the building.

Mr. Makari stated that he would like to paint the building, but has to ask the landlord.

Comm. Briggs asked if the temporary banner will be removed when the new signs are installed.

Mr. Makari said yes, the banner will be removed.

Shelby Smith, 1640 Foxridge Circle, Auburn stated that she owns the home across from the business. She wonders why the owner isn't proposing to repaint or improve the building.

Chrm. Merz asked staff if they know of any plans for the building to be improved.

Planner Geiger stated that the proposal is for the signs, and not re-painting of the building at this time.

Comm. Kosla stated that he feels that the sign on the back of the building is necessary for visibility to pedestrians. He expressed his desire that the business owner be penalized if he does not remove the banners soon.

Director Wong stated that since the applicant has been given until May 11, 2007 to remove the banners, if he does not do so he will be cited.

Comm. Smith stated that he thinks the proposed signs are fine, but he would also like for the building to be painted.

Comm. Briggs said she does not think the sign on the rear of the building is necessary.

Comm. Elder pointed out that this particular sign states that the business is an official smog check station, so it would need to be moved for patrons to be aware of the availability of smog check.

Comm. Kidd stated that she thinks all three signs are necessary.

Chrm. Merz stated that he doesn't think the Commission has the right to deny the signs based on Comm. Worthington's previous comments regarding the groundwater testing.

#### Comm. Kidd **MOVED** to:

Adopt Resolution No. 07-13 as presented, approving three (3) wall signs for Meritage Auto Repair located at 1145 Lincoln Way.

#### Comm. Kosla **SECONDED.**

AYES: Kosla, Smith, Elder, Kidd, Chrm. Merz

NOES: Briggs

ABSTAIN: Worthington ABSENT: Thompson

The motion was approved.

### ITEM VI: COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT FOLLOW-UP REPORTS

A. City Council Meetings

The City Council will hear the Walker Parcel Map Appeal on May 14, 2007. The Council will also be considering the Commission's recommendations for plastic signs and lettering for the Design Guidelines.

- B. Future Planning Commission Meetings
  There will be a meeting on May 15, 2007.
- C. Historic Design Review Commission Meetings There will be a meeting on May 15, 2007.
- D. Reports

None.

Comm. Kidd expressed her appreciation to staff for their efforts and attention to detail.

#### ITEM VII: COMMISSION REPORTS

Comm. Smith mentioned some signs, such as the sushi restaurant, that are out of compliance with their approval by the Commission.

Director Wong said staff would follow up and asked that any such issues that the Commissioners have be addressed to him via e-mail.

#### ITEM X: ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Fraizer, Administrative Assistant